

1

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

BEFORE THE GUAM CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS



IN THE MATTER OF:

LYNDA B. AGUON,

Employee,

VS.

DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION.

Management.

ADVERSE ACTION **CASE NO.: 19-AA02T**

DECISION AND JUDGMENT

INTRODUCTION

The above captioned matter came before the Guam Civil Service Commission (CSC) January 14, 2020, to review the recommendations of the Administrative Law Judge (ALJ), Eric D. Miller. Employee, Lynda B. Aguon hereinafter ("Employee") was employed by the Department of Parks and Recreation as the Guam Historic Preservation Officer for the Guam Historic Resources Division. On June 18, 2019, Employee was served with Final Notice of Adverse Action (FNAA) alleging numerous acts of insubordination, mistreatment of staff, misuse of official vehicle, and other bad behavior.

22

23

DECISION AND JUDGMENT

Lynda B. Aguon vs. Department of Parks and Recreation Adverse Action CSC Case No.: 19-AA02T

Page 1 of 3

25

24

DECISION AND JUDGMENT

Lynda B. Aguon vs. Department of Parks and Recreation Adverse Action CSC Case No.: 19-AA02T

JURISDICTION

The jurisdiction of the Guam Civil Service Commission is based upon the Organic Act of Guam, and 4 GCA §4403 (b).

BURDEN OF PROOF

Following the ruling in *Port Authority of Guam v. Josette J. Javelosa*, 2018 Guam 9, the Commission must make an initial determination as to the burden of proof on Management. By Decision and Order dated October 3, 2019 the Commission found that Management's burden is the clear and convincing evidence standard because the factual allegations do not correspond to statutory prohibitions in the criminal code.

FINDING OF FACT AND CONCLUSION OF LAW

The ALJ found by clear and convincing evidence that Employee was insubordinate when she advised her Director that he could not force her to comply with his order to review and address emails from Administrative Assistant, Christine Olkeriil. The ALJ also found by clear and convincing evidence that Employee was insubordinate when she violated a written order not to discuss the investigation of complaints about her with other employees while the investigation was in progress. Employee admitted to talking to employees, Michelle Yamasta and Barbara Lujan, during the investigation. The ALJ found that none of the other allegations would justify termination. The ALJ recommended that the adverse action be affirmed.

Present at the hearing for Management were Assistant Attorney General Donna Lawrence, Assistant Attorney General Matthew Wolff, and Acting Director Richard Ybanez. Present for Employee was John R. Bell, Esquire, and Employee. Commissioners present at the hearing were Chairman Juan K. Calvo, Commissioner Priscilla T. Tuncap, Commissioner Emilia F. Rice, and Commissioner Anthony P. Benavente.

1

2

At the hearing, ALJ Miller read his written decision into the record. 4 GCA §4405 (c)(2) provides that the Commission will have the authority to accept, modify, or reject the ALJ's decision in whole or in part.

Chairman Calvo asked if the Commissioners wished to reject the ALJ's recommendations.

The vote was 4 to 0 opposing rejection.

The vote was 3 to 1 to modify the recommendation. (Commissioner Benavente dissenting). The Commission voted 3 to 1 to accept the recommendation (Chairman Calvo dissenting). Management has the burden of proof 4 GCA §4407. The affirmative vote of four (4) members shall be required for any action of the Commission 4 GCA§4402. In this case Management failed to get the affirmative vote of four (4) Commissioners to affirm the termination. Employee prevails. The adverse action is revoked. The Employee shall be reinstated immediately until such time as this decision is overturned by judicial review. 4 GCA §4406 (g). Employee is awarded back pay, reasonable attorney fees and costs.

IT IS SO ADJUDGED on this 1 th day of Frebruary, 2020

JUAN K. CALVO

Chairman

PRISCILLA T. TUNCAP

Commissioner

ANTHONY P. BENAVENTE

Commissioner

JOHN SMITH

Vice Chairman

EMIĽÍA F. RICE

Commissioner

21

22

23

24